




MANAGEMENT RESPONSE

Evaluation Title:	Terminal Evaluation of Project 2023AA “Building urban economic resilience during and after COVID-19”		
Period of Review:	2020 - 2022		
Date of Evaluation Report:	30/12/2022		
		Date	Signature
Approved by	Chief, a.i., PMU Nicolas Dath-Baron	14/03/2023	
Cleared by:	Director of Division Paola Deda	14/03/2023	
Prepared by:	Project Manager Gulnara Roll	14/03/2023	

Recommendation 1:

ECA, ECE, ECLAC, ESCAP and ESCWA, with support from UN-Habitat and UNCDF as relevant, should continue efforts to engage pilot cities and help them further develop their capacities to access funding for their plans. The evaluation identified some risks to the sustainability of project results, including limited access to funding, decreased political ownership following possible government changes in the future, low social ownership and, to a lesser extent, limited technical capacities within local governments and institutional arrangements that hinder the adoption of the Economic Resilience Building Plans (ERBPs). To address these risks, the following actions should be considered:

- Continue engaging local governments from the pilot cities in ongoing or upcoming projects and activities to provide them with continued support to access funding and to improve their technical capacities for the implementation and monitoring of the ERBPs. Cities would particularly benefit from continued and practical advice on how to tap on existing opportunities for increasing public revenue, and on how to access international and private-sector funding for the most cost-intensive actions included in the ERBPs (e.g., those related with basic infrastructure). Advice is particularly needed to develop a pipeline of projects and match them with adequate types of funding from different sources.
- Continue providing spaces for experience exchange among pilot cities, both at the regional and global level, including joint events in different fora and the integration of local governments into ongoing initiatives, such as the Making Cities Resilient 2030 network, the Asia – Pacific Mayors Academy (launched by ESCAP, UN-Habitat and other organizations), and the Malaga Global Coalition for Municipal Finance led by UNCDF. This would provide local governments with opportunities to access expert advice and capacity building to implement their ERBPs, while at the same time fostering long-term engagement in resilience building. Ideally, experience exchange should go beyond mayors to involve local focal points and other city officials.

Management Response: UNECE accepts the recommendation.

Follow up actions and responsibilities:

As the project ended, within currently existing limited financial resources, UNECE continues providing support to the three pilot cities in the UNECE region, Bishkek (Kyrgyzstan), Tirana (Albania) and Kharkiv (Ukraine) through tailored interventions. In Kharkiv (Ukraine), UNECE supports activities on developing a reconstruction masterplan for building back better after the war and in implementation of

the masterplan, also through linking the city government to international financial institutions. In Bishkek (Kyrgyzstan), UNECE supports building the local capacity for generating financing for municipal projects. UNECE established partnership with CDIA (Cities Development Initiative for Asia) which provided USD 500,000 to the development of investment projects aimed to improve five pilot informal settlements. UNECE cooperates with the city of Bishkek on the improvement of the informal settlements on regular basis to generate additional funds and investments. In the city of Tirana (Albania), UNECE continues working on the topics of informal settlements and affordable housing.

The full implementation of this recommendation is subject to the mobilization of substantial extrabudgetary funds. The project partners have submitted a proposal to the UNDA for a follow up project to continue supporting the pilot cities.

On the second point of the first recommendation, UNECE:

- Continues to be engaged in the Making Cities Resilient 2030 network;
- Is engaging with the UN DESA Financing for Sustainable Development Office, which provides a global platform for building capacities of local governments on municipal infrastructure asset management;
- Established the UN [Forum of Mayors](#) as a team of specialists under the UNECE Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management. The Forum of Mayors is a UN platform for mayors and vice-mayors to exchange experiences and best practices and learn from each other.

Responsibility: UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit

Timeline: 31 December 2023

Recommendation 2:

ECA, ECE, ECLAC, ESCAP, ESCWA, UN-Habitat and UNCDF should consider mobilizing resources (UNDA or other) for a follow-up project to support the implementation and monitoring of ERBPs in the pilot cities. A draft concept note for a DA 16th tranche project was developed to support urban economic resilience building for inclusive responses and recovery regarding natural, man-made disasters, internal and external shocks. If implemented in some of the pilot cities, this proposed project could help them update the city diagnostics, track progress in the ERBPs, and continue building their capacities in relation with resilience planning, monitoring (including data collection and management), and implementation in the context of the multiple economic crises that cities are facing in the current international juncture.

Management Response: UNECE accepts the recommendation.

Follow up actions and responsibilities:

The DA 16th tranche concept note was submitted by the consortium and is currently being reviewed by UN DESA.

Responsibility: Housing and Land Management Unit

Timeline: 31 December 2023

Recommendation 3:

ECA and ECE, with support from ECLAC, ESCAP, ESCWA, UN-Habitat and UNCDF as relevant, should systematize the lessons learned from this project. The project produced a large number of knowledge products and deliverables, most of which are available on the project website. It would be useful to distil this vast knowledge into policy guidelines for economic resilience building that would provide practical and concise guidance to national and subnational governments regarding how to strengthen urban economic resilience in the face of external shocks.

Management Response: UNECE accepts the recommendation.

Follow up actions and responsibilities:

The project already started systematizing the collected knowledge in the Compendium of practices “Global Compendium of Practices on Local Economic and Financial Recovery” available at <https://urbaneconomicresilience.org/deliverables-resources/global-compendium-of-practices-on-local-economic-and-financial-recovery/>, as well as in the five Regional Policy Briefs on building urban economic resilience during and after COVID-19, all five available at <https://urbaneconomicresilience.org/deliverables-resources/regional-policy-briefs-on-urban-economic-recovery-and-resilience/>. Subject to funding of the new UNDA follow-up project, a global survey to systematize the collected knowledge as well as global policy guidelines will be produced.

Responsibility: Housing and Land Management Unit
Timeline: 31 December 2023

Recommendation 5:

ECA, ECE, ECLAC, ESCAP, ESCWA, UN-Habitat and UNCDF should continue implementing joint, global projects to fully harness potential synergies and multiply outcomes. Future joint projects should replicate the project’s governance arrangements, including the appointment of a leading agency supported by a project manager, weekly Steering Committee meetings, knowledge management systems, and a unified implementation strategy with clear but adaptable deliverables and milestones.

Management Response: UNECE accepts the recommendation.

Follow up actions and responsibilities:

The project governance structure will be replicated in the 16th Tranche project application which was submitted to UN DESA. Considering the efficiency of the “Building Urban Economic Resilience during and after COVID-19” in terms of the project governance arrangements, the consortium agreed to continue in the same manner.

Responsibility: Housing and Land Management Unit
Timeline: 31 December 2023

Recommendation 6:

UNDA projects should support capacity building throughout implementation. While supporting diagnostic and planning processes is key to advance urban economic resilience, and more broadly the 2030 Agenda, so is developing implementation capacities, especially at the local level. As already mentioned above, efforts should focus, in particular, on helping local governments strengthen their capacities to increase public revenues and develop a pipeline of projects matched with adequate types of funding from different sources. The proposed DA 16th tranche project mentioned above is a promising step in this direction.

Management Response: UNECE accepts the recommendation.

Follow up actions and responsibilities:

Capacity building was already provided during the whole project period through regular meetings with the local governments and close communication among the partner organizations, international and local consultants on one hand and the cities’ governments on the other. Subject to the approval of the follow-up UNDA project, capacity building activities are planned to be conducted starting from the very beginning of the project as the new project will be building on outcomes of the diagnostic assessment, which was already conducted. Capacity building activities in the new project will be focusing on efforts to help local governments strengthen their capacities to increase public revenues and develop a pipeline of projects matched with adequate types of funding from different sources

Responsibility: Housing and Land Management Unit
Timeline: 31 December 2023